Church confronts State: 19th-century-style

Cartoon appearing toward the end of the Kulturkampf (late 1870s):
Chancellor Otto von Bismarck plays chess with Pope Leo XIII
Among the pieces in the Pope’s arsenal: the “Syllabus [of Errors]” and the “Encyclical” (from which emanates the caption “Interdiction”)
Among the pieces in the Chancellor’s arsenal: “Closing of Monasteries” [Kloster Gesetz].

Church confronts State: 21st-century-style

Photo appearing in in Boston Metro August 1-3, 2003 [Dylan Martinez/Reuters]
“No God || Atheism is Liberty”// Democracy Yes; Theocracy No”
“Atheists for the laicity of the State”
“Slavery itself, considered as such in its essential nature, is not at all contrary to the natural and divine law, and there can be several just titles of slavery and these are referred to by approved theologians and commentators of the sacred canons... It is not contrary to the natural and divine law for a slave to be sold, bought, exchanged or given.” – Holy Office Instruction, signed by Pius IX (June 20, 1866)

“What is more, it is agreed that such acts are permitted of their nature, but no one has the right to reduce men to slavery, so that they become merchandise or property of another.” – Pius IX,

“It is in full accord with human nature that juridical-political structures should afford all their citizens the chance to participate freely and actively in establishing the constitutional bases of a political community, governing the state, determining the scope and purpose of various institutions, and choosing leaders.” – Vatican II, Gaudium et Spes (1965)

“Socialism and democracy are pests”. – Pius IX Qui pluribus (1846); Singulari quadem (1854); Syllabus of Errors § IV (1864)

“[It is an error to say that] every human being is free to embrace and profess that religion which, led by the light of reason, he/she believes to be true”. – Pius IX Syllabus of Errors (1864), Denziger #1715.

“‘The joys and the hopes, the griefs and the anxieties of the people of this age, especially those who are poor or in any way afflicted, these are the joys and hopes, the griefs and anxieties of the followers of Christ.”” – Vatican II, Dignitatis Humanae (1965) § 2

COURSE DESCRIPTION:

The overarching question to be investigated is a simple one: “Why and how was Catholicism imagined to be radically incompatible with ‘modernity’ — whatever the speaker might mean by that term — from the time of the French Revolution until the Second Vatican Council [1962-1965]?”

Beginning with the French Revolution, “Roman Catholicism” came to be imagined by others — and constructed by itself — over and against “the modern” in at least three senses:

first, against the concept of temporal (i.e., historical) change and “progress”;

second, against the evolution of subjective individualism — i.e., the notion that the private judgment and liberty of individual conscience is prior to (and superior to) communal claims; and as a corollary,

third, against the notion that “religion” is a private affair to be kept separate from the public sphere. (The controversy over the “separation of church and state” continues into the present as one manifestation of this larger private/public division.)

The 19th century widened the gap: urbanization, democratization, emergent laicist nation-states, and scientific positivism all posed threats to traditional agrarian and authoritarian conceptions of organic corporatist society. The end-result was the invention of a cosmopolitan (i.e., ultramontane) “Roman Catholicism” that stood over-and-against the dominant 19th-c. cultures of subjective individualism, nationalist liberal and historically self-conscious thought. Using the taxonomy classically posed by H. Richard Niebuhr in Christ and Culture, one could say that late-modern Roman Catholicism departed from a traditional stance of “Christ-above-culture” — a model stretching back to Thomas Aquinas of religion as a synthetic force. Instead, it adopted a newly dualistic and combative stance of “Christ-against-culture” — an “invented tradition” pitting an intransigent integralist Church against society and culture.

In the wake of the Second World War, the Holocaust, and the alliances of Catholicism with Fascist states — and in the midst of the Cold War and the problem of Communist states — this dualistic opposition was rethought and reversed in Vatican II. Dignitatis Humanae declared that “A sense of the dignity of the human person has been impressing itself more and more deeply on the consciousness of contemporary humanity, and the demand is increasingly made that human beings should act on their own judgment...” while Gaudium et Spes proclaimed the Church’s solidarity with modern humanity: “The joys and the hopes, the griefs and the anxieties of the people of this age, especially those who are poor or in any way afflicted, these are the joys and hopes, the griefs and anxieties of the followers of Christ.”

In the course of tracing this narrative, we will survey a number of topics: anti-Enlightenment rhetoric; nationalist liberalism and democracy; the Syllabus of Errors; rationalism v. fideism; neo-medievalist inventions of tradition such as the Thomistic philosophy; the challenge of Marx and “the social question”; the “Modernist Crisis”; anti-Semitism; nouvelle théologie; Vatican II. In light of the Church’s changing moral doctrine in areas of specific modernist concern — usury, slavery,
political and religious liberty, human sexuality — we will ask whether the 19th-c. liberal concept of “development” is radical enough to account for such significant shifts in mentality and teaching.

CLASS REQUIREMENTS:

1) Attendance at all classes
2) Approximately 200 pages of reading each week (usually from a secondary work)
3) Thirteen short (1-2 page) papers, due for Tuesday seminar discussions, answering a question concerning the reading.

PROCEDURES:

On Tuesdays we will discuss the week’s assigned readings from secondary sources. The short papers due at the beginning of class will facilitate these discussions.

On Thursdays students will bring to class printouts of assigned primary texts (e.g., encyclicals, conciliar documents, correspondence). (They need not have been read before class.) We will closely read several paragraphs of these primary texts within the historical context set out by the secondary works discussed on Tuesday. Time will be reserved at the end of class for a pre-lecture in preparation for next Tuesday’s reading.

REQUIRED TEXTS available at the Boston College Bookstore and on reserve at O’Neill Library:


RECOMMENDED BOOKS limited number available at Boston College Bookstore; on reserve at O’Neill Library

2. A.N. Wilson, God’s Funeral (Ballantine, 2000) ISBN0345439597
I. SECULARIZATION: MODERNITY V. MYSTERY?

WEEK I  A RAGE FOR ORDER v. FEAR OF CHAOS: THE FACT OF TEMPORAL CHANGE

T 09/02  Introduction
Reading: Letter to B.C. Magazine

R 09/04  A. Must Mystery be Unchanging?

We begin with the idea of “modernity” as the invention of linear time: setting oneself over and against “traditional” visions of the world, and embracing the notion that the world is (a) materialist, (b) fated to be always progressing (i.e., an inversion of the “Great Chain of Being”) and (c) composed of autonomous individuals. If “time” is a forward motion always progressing; and if “religion” is a stable “sacred canopy” under which we can find refuge from the chaos and ravages of time; then what are we to make of doctrinal development?

ASSIGNMENT:


Class reading:
Anonymous, “The Treatise of the Three Imposters” [1777]
Diderot, Supplement to the Voyage of Bougainville [1771]
Voltaire, Philosophical Dictionary: “Soul”; “Tolerance”; “Transubstantiation” [1764]
Abbé Sieyès, “What is the Third Estate?” [January 1789]
“Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen” [August 26, 1789]
Condorcet, “Sketch for a Historical Picture of the Progress of the Human Mind” [1794]

Recommended: H. Richard Niebuhr, Christ and Culture
Nancy C. Ring et al, Introduction to the Study of Religion: 4-20; 52-67
Steve Bruce, Religion in the Modern World: From Cathedrals to Cults: 9-68
Alan Aldrige, Religion in the Contemporary World: A Sociological Introduction: 56-88
René Rémond, Religion and Society in Modern Europe: 1-14

WEEK II  1789: “ROMAN(tic) CATHOLICISM”: “ENEMY OF THE ENLIGHTENMENT”

T 09/09  ASSIGNMENT: Darrin McMahon, Enemies of the Enlightenment

R 09/11  Class reading:
The Civil Constitution of the Clergy [1790]
Vatican-Napoleonic French Concordat [1801]
Chateaubriand, The Genius of Christianity [1802]
Joseph De Maistre, On the Pope [1819]
WEEK III  1848: ANACHRONISM: PAPAL MONARCHY IN THE AGE OF LIBERAL NATIONALISM


R 09/18  Class reading:

- Giuseppe Mazzini, *On Nationality as a Key to Social Development* [1852]
- Daniel O'Connell, Speech on Justice for Ireland [Feb 4, 1836]
- Theodor Herzl, *On the Jewish State* [1896]
- Jeremy Bentham, *Principles of Legislation* [1802]
- T. B. Macaulay, Speech on Parliamentary Reform [2 March 1831]
- Tsar Nicholas I: Imperial Manifesto on Poland [March 25, 1832]
- Gregory XVI, *Mirari Vos* [August 15, 1832]

WEEK IV  1858: SUBJECTIVE INDIVIDUALISM v. ORGANIC CORPORatism

T 09/23  ASSIGNMENT:

- Owen Chadwick, *Secularization of the European Mind*: 1-47; 107-139
- John McGreevy, *Catholicism and American Freedom*: 7-126


R 09/25  Class reading:

- Auguste Comte, *Course in Positivist Philosophy* [1830-1842]
- John Stuart Mill, *On Liberty* [1859]
- John Stuart Mill, *Representative Government* [1861]
- Catholic teaching on slavery 16th to 19th centuries
- *Jesuit Slaveholding in Maryland, 1717-1838*
- Abraham Lincoln, Second Inaugural Address [March 4, 1865]
- Vatican-Ecuador Concordat [1862]
- Pius IX, *Syllabus of Errors* [8 Dec 1864]
- Quanta Cura [8 Dec 1864]
- The Italian Law of Guarantees [May 13, 1871]
- Etsi Multa [21 November 1873]
- Prussian Law on the Appointment of Clergy [May 21, 1874]
- Leo XIII, *Immortale Dei* [November 1, 1885]
WEEK V  1870: INVENTING TRADITIONS: NEO-MEDIEVALISM, INFALLIBILITY, NEO-SCHOLASTICISM

T 09/29  ASSIGNMENT:
Johann von Döllinger, Letters from Rome on the Council [1870];
Abp. Peter Kenrick of St. Louis, “An Address in Opposition to Papal Infallibility” [1870]
“Pretended ‘Speech of a Bishop in the Council’” [1870]

Recommended: Owen Chadwick, A History of the Popes, 161-312
Robert McClory, Power and the Papacy: The People and Politics Behind
the Doctrine of Infallibility

R 10/02  Class reading:
Rev. Thomas Mozley, M.A., Letters from Rome on the Occasion of the Oecumenical Council
Vatican I constitutions:
   De Fide catholica [24 April 1870] and Pastor Aeternus [18 July 1870]
Leo XIII, Aeterni Patris [1879]
Maurice de Wulf, Scholasticism Old and New: An Introduction to Scholastic
   Philosophy Medieval and Modern [1903]
   The System of Thomas Aquinas [1922]
Elia Blanc, Manuale Philosophiae Scholasticae [1901]
Ludwig Ott, Fundamentals of Catholic Dogma [1954]
Catechism of the Catholic Church [1992]
   “The Church is One, Holy, Catholic, and Apostolic” [¶¶ 811-870]
   “Man’s Capacity for God” [¶¶ 27-49]
II. 1880-1914: LAICISM V. INTEGRALISM: “A WORLD WITHOUT MYSTERY”

WEEK VI  1891: SOCIAL REVOLUTION; FEARS OF “THE CROWD”

T 10/07  ASSIGNMENT:
Owen Chadwick, Secularization of the European Mind: 48-106
John Toews, ed., Communist Manifesto With Related Documents:
Karl Marx, The Economic and Philosophic Manuscripts of 1844 [1844]
Frederick Engels, “Draft of a Communist Confession of Faith” [1847]
Karl Marx, The Communist Manifesto [1848]
Engels, “Speech at Karl Marx’s Funeral” [1883]

John McGreevy, Catholicism and American Freedom: 127-165

Recommended:
Owen Chadwick, A History of the Popes, 1830-1914, 312-331
Robert Heilbroner, “The Dreams of the Utopian Socialists,” Worldly Philosophers, 104-135

R 10/09  Class Reading:
Leo XIII, Rerum Novarum [1891]
Pius XI, Casti Connubii [1930]
Pius XI, Quadragesimo Anno [1931]
Dorothy Day, From Union Square to Rome [1939]

John Paul II, Laborem Exercens [1981]

WEEK VII  1905: J’ACCUSE! : DREYFUS AFFAIR, ACT OF SEPARATION, R.C. MODERNIST CRISIS

T 10/14  ASSIGNMENT:
Michael Burns, France and the Dreyfus Affair: Documentary History (1999)
Owen Chadwick, Secularization of the European Mind: 161-228
Roger Aubert, Roman Catholic Modernist Crisis

Recommended: Owen Chadwick, A History of the Popes, 1830-1914, 332-405

R 10/16  Class reading:
Edouard LeRoy, “What is a Dogma?” [La Quinzaine April 16, 1905]
Pius X, Pascendi Dominici Gregis [1906]
Pius X, Lamentabili [1907]
Decrees of the Pontifical Biblical Commission, 1905-1915
George Tyrrell, Through Scylla and Charybdis [1907]
Alfred Loisy, The Gospel and The Church [L’Évangile et l’Église, 1914]
Henri Bergson, Creative Evolution [1907]
III. Renouveau Catholique: EMBRACING MYSTERY

A. FIN-DE-SIÈCLE

WEEK VIII THE DEVOTIONAL ALTERNATIVE: LOURDES IN THE AGE OF DARWIN

T 10/21 ASSIGNMENT:  
Ruth Harris, Lourdes: Body and Spirit in the Secular Age:  

R 10/23 Class Reading:  
Friedrich Nietzsche, On the Genealogy of Morals [1897]  
Emile Zola, Lourdes [1894/1904]  
J-K Huysmans, The Crowds of Lourdes [1905]  
Sigmund Freud, The Future of an Illusion [1927]  
________________, Civilization and Its Discontents [1930]

WEEK IX THE DECADENT ALTERNATIVE: SAINT HYSTERIA

T 10/28 ASSIGNMENT:  
J.-K. Huysmans, Là-bas

R 10/30 Class Reading:  
Max Nordau, Degeneration [1892]  
Dom S. Louismet, O.S.B., Mysticism — True & False [NOVEMBER 1918]  
François Mauriac, Thérèse [1927]  
Georges Bernanos, Diary of a Country Priest [1936]  
Graham Greene, The Power and the Glory [1940]  
________________, The End of the Affair [1951]

B. CHRISTIAN EXISTENTIALISM IN THE “AGE OF ANXIETY”

WEEK X THEISTIC EXISTENTIALISM

T 11/04 ASSIGNMENT:  
Jean-Paul Sartre, No Exit [1945]  
{Le Monde cassé, "Position et approches concrètes du mystère ontologique," [1933]}

R 11/06 Class Reading:  
Thomas Merton, Seeds of Contemplation [1949]  
________________., Thoughts in Solitude [1956, 1958]  
Flannery O’Connor, Mystery and Manners [1957-1964]  
Jack Kerouac, Visions of Gerard [1958]  
Dom Aelred Graham, Zen Catholicism [1963]  
Thomas Merton, The Way of Chuang Tzu [1965]  
________________., Mystics and Zen Masters [1967]
V. THE CHURCH IN THE MODERN WORLD

A. 1950-1965: COMING TO TERMS: POST-HOLOCAUST / COLD WAR

WEEK XI  FROM RESISTANCE TO NOUVELLE THÉOLOGIE

T 11/11  ASSIGNMENT:

John McGreevy, Catholicism and American Freedom: 189-249
Michael Phayer, Catholic Church and the Holocaust: 1-19; 159-216

Recommended: Jose M. Sanchez, Pius XII and the Holocaust: Understanding the Controversy

R 11/13  Class Reading:

Italian Concordat [1929]
German Concordat [1933]
Anglo-Vatican Relations 1914-1939, [on the German Concordat, 1933]
Pius XI, Divini Redemptoris [1937]
Catholic Good Friday Liturgy
Pius XII, Summi Pontificatus [20 October 1939]
Pius XII, Allocution [2 October 1945] and Excommunication of Communists [1 July 1949]
Spanish Concordat [1953]

Henri de Lubac, S.J., Mystery of the Supernatural [1946 / 1965]
Pius XII: Humani Generis [1950]
C. Vollert, “Humani Generis and the Limits of Theology,” TS 12 (1951)
J.C. Fenton, “Reform and Integralism,” American Ecclesiastical Review 126 (1952)
John XXIII: Pacem in Terris [1963]

WEEK XII  VATICAN COUNCIL II

T 11/18  ASSIGNMENT:

Xavier Rynne, Vatican Council II

R 11/20  Class Reading:

Dignitatis Humanae [7 Dec 1965]
Gaudium et Spes [7 Dec 1965]
Fr. Lucian Pulvermacher, OFM Cap., “Vatican II Council Teaches Heresy”
Catechism of the Catholic Church, ¶¶ 1776-1802 [1992]
John Paul II, Veritatis Splendor [6 August 1993], ¶ 34 and footnote 58
A 1998 Lilly Foundation poll of Catholics in their twenties and thirties on their practice of contraception could not even be reported: support for papal teaching was so minimal it fell within the margin of error. Likewise, as many Catholics now have abortions as non-Catholics in general, and the Catholic rate is 29 percent higher than for Protestants. Dean R. Hogue, William D. Dinges, Mary Johnson, Juan L. Gonzales Jr., Young Adult Catholics: Religion in the Culture of Choice (2001), 200; Stanley K. Henshaw and Katheryn Cost, “Abortion Patients in 1994-1995: Characteristics and Contraceptive Use,” Alan Guttmacher Institute, Family Planning Perspectives, Vol. 28 (July-August 1996), 142; cited in Garry Wills, “High Fidelity,” New York Review of Books (5 December 2002): 40-43.
FOR FURTHER READING

WEEK I A Rage for Order vs. Fear of Chaos: The Fact of Temporal Change

Religion, supernatural, secularization:
Peter L. Berger, The Sacred Canopy; Elements of a Sociological Theory of Religion (Garden City, N.Y., Doubleday, 1967)
René Rémond, Religion and Society in Modern Europe (Oxford, 1999), esp.: “Introduction: Religion and Society,” 1-14
A.N. Wilson, God’s Funeral (Norton, 1999)
M.H. Abrams, Natural Supernaturalism (1971)
Peter Brooks, The Melodramatic Imagination (1976) [introduction]

“Modernity”

Church and Society
H. Richard Niebuhr, Christ and Culture (New York, 1951)

Development of Doctrine
Owen Chadwick, From Bossuet to Newman
John T. Noonan, Jr., The Scholastic Analysis of Usury (1957)
____________________, Contraception: A History of its Treatment by the Catholic Theologians and Canonists

HS473: Catholicism Confronts Modernity — 11
HS473: Catholicism Confronts Modernity — 12

(1967; Belknap, 1986)

WEEK II  1789: “Roman(tic) Catholicism”: “Enemy of the Enlightenment”

Margaret C. Jacob, The Enlightenment: A Brief History With Documents (2001)

WEEK III  1848: Anachronism: Papal Monarchy in the Age of Liberal Nationalism

Martin Clark, The Italian Risorgimento (New York, 1998)

WEEK IV  1858: “The Spirit of the Age”: Subjective Individualism v. Organic Corporatism

Bernard Reardon, Liberalism and Tradition: Aspects of Catholic Thought in Nineteenth-century France (Cambridge, 1975)
Philip Gleason, “American Catholics and Liberalism,” in Catholicism and Liberalism: Contributions to American Public Philosophy, ed. R. Bruce Douglass and David Hollenbach (Cambridge, 1994), 45-75

Catholicism and Slavery

John Francis Maxwell, Slavery and the Catholic Church: The History of Catholic Teaching concerning the Moral Legitimacy of the Institution of Slavery (Chichester, 1975).
Madeleine Hooke Rice, American Catholic Opinion in the Slavery Controversy (New York, 1944)
Thomas Murphy, S.J., Jesuit Slaveholding in Maryland, 1717-1838 (New York, 2001)

WEEK V  1870: Inventing Traditions: Neo-Medievalism, Infallibilism, Neo-Scholasticism

Positivism and Discontents

Ernest Renan, The Life of Jesus [1863]
Nietzsche, On the Use and Abuse of History [1874]
Mary Poovey, A History of the Modern Fact : Problems of Knowledge in the Sciences of Wealth and Society

**Neo-Medievalism**
Viollet-le-Duc, *Dictionnaire raisonné* [1858]
James J. Walsh, *The Thirteenth: Greatest of Centuries* (New York, 1913)
Maurice De Wulf, *Mediaeval Philosophy Illustrated from the System of Thomas Aquinas* [1921?, tr. 1922]

**Vatican I / Infallibility**
Robert McClory, *Power and the Papacy: The People and Politics Behind the Doctrine*

**WEEK VI  1891: Social Revolution: Fears of “The Crowd”**

The “Social Question” in the 19th century
Work and Revolution in France: *The Language of Labor from the Old Regime to 1848* (Cambridge, 1980)

Catholic Social Teaching
J.L. Krier Mich, *Catholic Social Teaching and Movements* (Mystic, CT, 1998)

**WEEK VII  1907: J’Accuse! : Separation, The R.C. Modernist Crisis, and “The Age of Conversions”**

R.C. Modernist Crisis
Bernard Reardon, ed., *Roman Catholic Modernism* (Stanford, 1970)

Post-Darwinian Anti-Semitism

On or about 1910
Carl Schorske, *Thinking With History* (1999)
Peter Stansky, *On or About December 1910*
Robert Wohl, *The Generation of 1914*

**Henri Bergson**


**WEEK VIII**  
**The Devotional Alternative: Lourdes in the Age of Darwin**


**WEEK IX**  
**The Decadent Alternative: Saint Hysteria**

Converts, Decadence and the Catholic Literary Revival

Léon Bloy, *The Woman Who Was Poor* [1897]
Theodore P. Fraser, *The Modern Catholic Novel in Europe* (1994);
Ellis Hanson, *Decadence and Catholicism* (1997);
Patrick Allitt, *Catholic Converts British and American Intellectuals Turn to Rome* (Cornell, 1997)

**Hysteria diagnosis and anti-clericalism**

Jan Goldstein, *Console and Classify: The French Psychiatric Profession in the Nineteenth Century* (1987);
___________, “The Hysteria Diagnosis and the Politics of Anti-Clericalism in Late Nineteenth Century France,” *Journal of Modern History* (1982);

**Hygiene mentality**

HS473: Catholicism Confronts Modernity — 14

**Prostitution as Metaphor of Modernity**

Alain Corbin, *Women for Hire: Prostitution and Sexuality in France after 1850* (1982);

**Madness / masturbation / homosexuality / schizophrenia**


**Sexuality and race**

Sander L. Gilman, *Difference and Pathology: Stereotypes of Sexuality, Race, and Madness* (1985);

**WEEK X** Theistic Existentialism and “The Catholic Novel”

**WEEK XI** From Resistance to *Nouvelle Théologie*

**Organicism, Corporatism, Fascism**

Jeffrey T. Schnapp, ed. and tr., *A Primer of Italian Fascism*, (Lincoln, NE, 2000)

**Holocaust**


**“New Theology”: Primary**

Yves Congar, “Attitudes towards Reform in the Church,” *Cross Currents* 1 (Summer 1951): 78-102
John Courtney Murray, S.J., “Contemporary Orientations of Catholic Thought on Church and State in the Light of History,” *Cross Currents* 2 (Fall 1951): 15-55
Gustave Weigel, S.J., “The Historical Background of the Encyclical *Humani Generis*,“ *Theological Studies* 12 (June 1951): 227-
“New Theology”: Secondary
McCool, Thomisms, on “transcendental thomism”

John XXIII
Thomas Cahill, Pope John XXIII (New York, 2002)

WEEK XII Vatican Council II

Vatican Council II
____________________, “Reform, Historical Consciousness, and Vatican II’s Aggiornamento,” in Tradition and Transition: Historical Perspectives on Vatican II (Michael Glazier, 1989).
____________________, “Vatican II: A Matter of Style,” WJST 2003 President’s Letter

John Courtney Murray, S.J. [primary texts]

Dignitatis Humanae

WEEK XIII 1968: Humanae Vitae

HS473: Catholicism Confronts Modernity — 16
1968
Kristin Ross, *May '68 and Its Afterlives* (Chicago, 2002)

**Euro-American Mentalities from 1950s and beyond**

**Contraception / Abortion**
John T. Noonan, Jr., *The Church and Contraception; the Issues at Stake* (1967)
__________________________, *A Private Choice, Abortion in America in the Seventies* (1979)

**Arguments from “Natural Law”**

**Week XIV Must Mystery Be Unchanging?**
Colleen Carroll, *The New Faithful: Why Young Adults Are Embracing Christian Orthodoxy* (Chicago, 2002)